

GUIDELINES FOR REVIEWING A CORE READING PROGRAM RUBRIC

Literacy By Design 2013 Houghton Mifflin Harcourt
Kindergarten

FINAL REVIEW

Directions for use:

- Thoroughly review the core reading program using the corresponding rubric.
- Only evaluate the individual components that correlate with the grade level to review. (*Note the placement of the "x" within the grade level columns.*)
- Each indicator must receive a score using the following criteria:
 - 2 – Exceeds expectations
 - 1 – Meets expectations
 - 0 – Does not meet expectations(*For any indicator receiving a 0, comments must be provided justifying the score.*)
- Record the total score for each area in the final row for the section.



The Reviewing a Reading Program Professional Development Participant's Guide publication was created for the Center on Instruction by the Florida Center for Reading Research at Florida State University. The Center on Instruction is operated by RMC Research Corporation in partnership with the Florida Center for Reading Research at Florida State University; Instructional Research Group; Lawrence Hall of Science at the University of California – Berkeley; Texas Institute for Measurement, Evaluation, and Statistics at the University of Houston; and The Meadows Center for Preventing Educational Risk at the University of Texas at Austin.

Guideline forms excerpted from *Reviewing a Reading Program Professional Development Module, Participant's Guide*, 2008, Center on Instruction.

The contents of the module and this document were developed under cooperative agreement S283B050034 with the U.S. Department of Education. However, these contents do not necessarily represent the policy of the Department of Education, and you should not assume endorsement by the Federal Government.



INSTRUCTIONAL DESIGN (ID)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments <i>(e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Is there empirical research on this program's efficacy?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	High efficacy is apparent from the studies done by Magnolia Consulting and the Educational Research Institute of America.
2. Are resources available to help the teacher understand the rationale for the instructional approach and program strategies (e.g., articles, explanations in the teacher manuals, references, and reliable websites)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	There are numerous resources available in many forms such as charts, writing resource guide and Writing Bridge, small group instruction organizer with comprehension component, leveled books, diagnostic assessments, and technology support: all of which are explained in the Program Overview.
3. Does the comprehensive program address the five components of reading (phonological/phonemic awareness, phonics, fluency, vocabulary and comprehension)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
4. In addition to the five components of reading, are other dimensions of reading such as spelling, writing, oral language, and listening comprehension addressed?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Yes, the program integrates reading and writing while providing modeling, scaffolding and practice for both.
5. Is there a scope and sequence?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
6. Are goals and objectives clearly stated?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Topics of instruction are listed, but not specific learning objectives. Standards alignment is listed in a separate book.
7. Are student materials aligned with instructional objective of the lesson?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
8. Do instructional materials increase in difficulty as students' skills strengthen?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
9. Are all lessons and activities (e.g., whole group, small group, and centers) reading-related?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
10. Is there a clear and logical organization to the lessons in:									
the order and procedures of each day's lesson?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
the inclusion of all necessary materials?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
the consistency of each day's lesson format?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
addressing the components of reading every day?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
11. Is instruction consistently explicit? Is it concise, specific, and related to the	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	



objective?									
12. Are teacher directives highly details to ensure accurate implementation?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
13. Does the lesson format facilitate frequent interactions between teacher and students?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
14. Is instruction consistently systematic? Is there a prescribed order for introducing specific skills within each component of reading?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
15. Are there coordinated instructional sequences and instructional routines which include:									
Modeling?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
Guided practice with feedback?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
Student practice and application?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Individual practice components with individual feedback (paper/pencil tasks) are not frequent. However, opportunity to differentiate based on student needs is documented in the teacher's guide.
Cumulative review?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
16. Are there many guided practice opportunities for explicit teaching and teacher-directed feedback (for typically progressing readers and more for struggling readers)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Yes, through oral practice.
17. Does the program provide clear guidance for the teacher to document student progress and inform instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
18. Does instruction make a clear connection among all five components?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
19. Is scaffolding a prominent part of the lessons?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
20. Are instructions for scaffolding specific within each lesson?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
21. Are teachers encouraged to give immediate, specific feedback (corrective or positive)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
22. Is differentiated instruction prominent?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
23. Is instruction differentiated based on assessment?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Objective assessments occur periodically, but not daily. Assessments are somewhat subjective in nature.
24. Are directions for differentiating instruction specific?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Differentiating instructions are generalized in nature.



25. Is small-group instruction (small teacher-pupil ratio) part of daily instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
26. Are there guidelines for forming flexible groups based on student progress?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
27. Are enrichment activities included for advanced students?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
28. Does the program provide instruction for English Learners?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
29. Does the program specify for whom it is appropriate (e.g., students on or above grade level, students slightly behind their peers, students more than one grade level behind their peers)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
TOTAL								62	

PHONOLOGICAL/ PHONEMIC AWARENESS (PA)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments <i>(e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Is phonological/phonemic awareness instruction explicit ?	X	X						2	This is an explicit part of the daily lesson plan.
2. Is phonological/phonemic awareness instruction systematic ?	X	X						2	
3. Does phonological/phonemic awareness instruction include coordinated instructional sequences and routines ?	X	X						2	
4. Is phonological/phonemic awareness instruction scaffolded ?	X	X						2	
5. Does phonological/phonemic awareness instruction include cumulative review ?	X	X						2	
6. Are assessments included to measure and monitor progress in phonological/phonemic awareness ?	X	X						1	Provided assessments in this area are somewhat infrequent.
7. Is PA only a small portion of the daily lesson?	X	X						2	
8. Does each day's lesson focus on only one or two PA skills (as opposed to several)?	X	X						2	
9. Are there instructions for PA activities to alert the teacher to student readiness?	X	X						1	Explicit detailed instructions on what to look for to indicate readiness was not evident for the benefit of the novice teacher. Formative assessments alert teacher to student readiness.



10. Does the program contain instructional activities that are designed to stimulate the growth of phonemic awareness?	X	X							2	
11. Does PA start with larger units (words and syllables) and progress to smaller units (phonemes)?	X	X							1	
12. Does PA start with rhyming and progress to phoneme isolation, blending, segmenting, and phoneme manipulation?	X	X							1	
13. Do students count the number of words in spoken sentences?	X								1	
14. Are there rhyming activities (recognition and production)?	X								1	
15. Are there alliteration activities?	X								1	
16. Are there activities that involve counting the number of syllables in a word?	X								1	
17. Are there activities that involve blending and segmenting syllables in a word?	X								1	
18. Are there activities for students to blend onsets and rimes?	X								2	
PHONEMIC AWARENESS										
19. Do activities follow the continuum of word types (beginning with short words that contain two or three phonemes)?	X	X							2	
20. Does instruction include physical representations (e.g., clapping, Elkonin boxes with markers, counters, tiles, fingers, and auditory cues) to help students make the connection between sounds and print (the alphabetic principle)?	X	X							2	
21. When PA activities are at the phoneme level, do students' activities target the first sound in words and then move to the last sound in words and finally focus on the middle sound in words?	X	X							1	
22. Are there blending activities at the phoneme level?	X	X							1	
23. Are there segmenting activities at the phoneme level?	X	X							1	
24. Does instruction include phoneme manipulation in words (i.e., deletion, addition, and substitution)?	X	X							1	
25. Once students demonstrate early phonemic awareness, is PA instruction	X	X							2	



linked to phonics instruction?									
26. Are the words used in PA activities found in subsequent word lists and text readings?	X	X							2
27. Does the program include a pronunciation guide for the various features of sound production (e.g., stop sounds and continuous sounds)?	X	X							0
28. Do computer-based programs pronounce sounds distinctly, correctly, and without distortion?	X	X							1
TOTAL								40	

PHONICS (P)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments <i>(e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Is phonics instruction explicit ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
2. Is phonics instruction systematic ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
3. Does phonics instruction include coordinated instructional sequences and routines ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Interactive strategies increase whole class engagement and individual practice opportunities.
4. Is phonics instruction scaffolded ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
5. Does phonics instruction include cumulative review ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
6. Are assessments included to measure and monitor progress in phonics ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Formalized assessments are infrequent.
7. Does the program teach both consonants and vowels?	X	X						2	
8. Are short vowels taught before long vowels?	X	X						2	
9. Are individual letter-sounds taught first, followed by digraphs, blends, and word families?	X	X	X					2	
10. Are high utility letter-sounds (e.g., /a/, /m/,	X	X						2	



/s/, /t/, /r/ found in short, one syllable CVC or CCVC words) introduced before low utility letter-sounds (e.g., /x/, /y/, /z/)?									
11. Are letter-sound correspondences taught to mastery and reviewed cumulatively?	X	X						1	Cumulative review of all letters learned not evident.
12. Are students taught an explicit strategy to decode words by their individual sounds?	X	X	X					2	
13. Do students practice decoding words that contain only those letter-sounds that have been previously taught?	X	X	X					2	
14. Once students have mastered a few letter-sounds, do they immediately apply them to reading word lists and short decodable texts?	X	X						1	
15. Are symbol to sound (decoding) and sound to symbol (spelling) taught explicitly?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
16. Is spelling taught during word learning so students can understand how sounds map onto print?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	This is found in phonemic awareness lessons.
17. Does instruction progress from simple to more complex concepts (e.g., CVC words before CCCVCC words and single syllable words before multisyllabic words)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
18. Does instruction follow the continuum of word types (beginning with CV and CVC words), incorporating continuous and stop sounds and blends in an appropriate sequence?	X	X						2	
19. Are reviews of previously taught concepts and words frequent and cumulative?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
20. Is emphasis placed on fluency practice for each phonics component (e.g., sound identification, CVC blending, word recognition, multisyllabic words, and text reading)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
21. Are there ample decodable texts (familiar and unfamiliar) for students to practice applying their skills with phonic elements?	X	X	X	X				2	
22. Are decodable texts read before trade books (for students to master new skills)?	X	X	X	X				2	
23. Does the program clarify that high frequency words can be both regular and irregular?	X	X	X	X				1	
24. Are irregular words that are visually or phonemically confusing (e.g., saw/was, where/were, of/off) separated?	X	X						2	



25. Does the program include explicit instruction in irregular words and decoding strategies for the decodable parts of words (clarifying that the letters represent their most common sounds as well as the irregularities of certain letters)?	X	X	X	X					2	
26. Are the numbers of high frequency, irregular words introduced in one lesson kept to a minimum?	X	X	X	X					2	
27. Are irregular words pre-taught before students read connected texts?	X	X	X	X					2	
28. Are difficult, high frequency words reviewed often and cumulatively?	X	X	X	X					2	
TOTAL									50	

FLUENCY (F)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments <i>(e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Is fluency instruction explicit ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
2. Is fluency instruction systematic ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
3. Does fluency instruction include coordinated instructional sequences and routines ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
4. Is fluency instruction scaffolded ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
5. Does fluency instruction include cumulative review ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
6. Are assessments included to measure and monitor progress in fluency ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
7. Does the program address all dimensions of fluency (speed, accuracy, and prosody)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
8. Does the program encourage the teacher to model speed, accuracy, and prosody?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
9. Are letter-sounds taught and practiced frequently to promote automaticity?	X	X						2	
10. Does fluency practice during letter-sound study and text reading involve the teacher's providing feedback to students?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
11. Is fluency instruction integrated into each day's lesson?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	This is found in small group instruction.



12. Is the decoding strategy taught so that it becomes automatic?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
13. Are irregular words taught to be recognized automatically?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
14. Is an explicit strategy taught as students transition from reading words in lists to reading connected text?	X	X						1	
TOTAL								27	

VOCABULARY (V)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments <i>(e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Is vocabulary instruction explicit ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
2. Is vocabulary instruction systematic ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
3. Does vocabulary instruction include coordinated instructional sequences and routines ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
4. Is vocabulary instruction scaffolded ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
5. Does vocabulary instruction include cumulative review ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
6. Are assessments included to measure and monitor progress in vocabulary ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
7. Is emphasis placed on listening and speaking vocabulary?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Listening and speaking is a part of the coordinated instructional sequence and routine.
8. Is there emphasis on reading and writing vocabulary?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
9. Are students exposed to diverse vocabulary through listening to or reading narrative and expository texts?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
10. Does the program include frequent use of teacher read-alouds using higher level books with explanation and instruction of key vocabulary?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
11. Does vocabulary instruction occur before, during, and after reading?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
12. Are a limited number of words selected for robust, explicit vocabulary instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
13. Are important, useful, and difficult words taught?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	



14. Does the instructional routine for vocabulary include:								
Introducing the word?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2
Presenting a student-friendly explanation?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2
Clarifying the word with examples?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2
Checking students' understanding?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2
15. Are ample opportunities provided to engage in oral vocabulary activities that:								
Repeat exposure to words in rich and multiple contexts?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2
Use everyday language to explain word meanings?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2
Connect word meanings to prior knowledge?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2
16. Are students given multiple opportunities to use new words in reading sentences, paragraphs, or longer texts?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2
17. Is extended instruction provided in multiple contexts to promote word awareness using word banks, vocabulary logs, writing, semantic maps, concept definition mapping, and word classification?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1
18. Are strategies taught over time to ensure understanding and correct application?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2
19. Are various aspects of word study included (either under vocabulary or word recognition) such as:								
Concepts of word meaning?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2
Multiple meanings?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2
Synonyms?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2
Antonyms?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2
20. Is the use of context to gain the meaning of an unfamiliar word kept to a minimum?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2
TOTAL								53



COMPREHENSION (C)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments <i>(e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Is comprehension instruction explicit ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
2. Is comprehension instruction systematic ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
3. Does comprehension instruction include coordinated instructional sequences and routines ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
4. Is comprehension instruction scaffolded ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
5. Does comprehension instruction include cumulative review ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
6. Are assessments included to measure and monitor progress in comprehension ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
7. Is learning to determine which strategy to use and why (metacognition) part of instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Reflection is an essential part of the instructional sequences and routine.
8. When a strategy is taught, is it applied frequently so students understand its usefulness?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
9. Does program instruction enable students to establish and adjust purposes for reading (e.g., reading to understand, interpret, inform, to enjoy, and to solve problems)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
10. Does instruction support the use of multiple, coordinated comprehension strategies?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
11. Are guided and supported cooperative learning groups suggested as an instructional technique?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
12. Does instruction begin with the use of short passages?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
13. Does instruction emphasize that students have a conceptual understanding of beginning, middle, and end?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
14. Does the program provide prompts for the teacher to guide the students through texts using think-alouds?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
15. Are models of effective questioning techniques (e.g., Bloom's taxonomy) provided to guide and monitor students' comprehension?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
16. Are there ample opportunities for students to listen to narrative and expository text?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	



17. Is instruction in narrative and expository text structures explicit?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2		
18. Do texts contain useful and familiar concepts and vocabulary?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2		
19. Are there instructional routines for comprehension strategies for use before, during, and after reading (e.g., prediction, story grammar, summarization, graphic organizers)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2		
20. Is the "main idea" strategy taught systematically (e.g., using pictures, then individual sentences, then paragraphs, etc.)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Explicit instruction did not exceed expectations for frequency. Activities mainly included in the writing bridge.	
21. Are elements of story grammar (e.g., setting, characters, important events, etc.) taught and used for retelling a story?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2		
22. Does instruction focus on discussion story grammar and comparing stories?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1		
23. Is story grammar introduced systematically, beginning with simple text that gradually becomes more complex?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1		
24. Are students taught to use graphic organizers to illustrate relationships among concepts in text (e.g., story maps, Venn diagrams, and semantic maps)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2		
25. Are explicit strategies for interpreting information from charts, graphs, tables, and diagrams taught?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1		
26. After instruction, is there systematic review of:										
Literal comprehension?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2		
Retelling?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2		
Main idea?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1		
Summarization?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2		
TOTAL									52	



STANDARDS ALIGNMENT	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments <i>(e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Is clear alignment provided to the Common Core State Standards?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Standards alignment is listed in a separate book.
2. Are instructional strategies using the Common Core State Standards embedded within and apparent throughout the program?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
TOTAL								4	

MOTIVATION AND ENGAGEMENT (M&E)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments <i>(e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
Does the program direct the teacher in ways to increase student motivation such as:									
1. Making reading relevant to students' lives?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
2. Providing meaningful goals for learning from texts?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
3. Making available a variety of choices (e.g., texts and assignments) that align with instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
4. Providing opportunities for students to work collaboratively?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
TOTAL								8	

ASSESSMENT (A)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments <i>(e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Are assessments included that teachers can use to guide student movement through the program (e.g., screening, progress monitoring, diagnostic, and outcome measures)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
2. Does the program provide teacher guidance in using assessment results to	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	



differentiate instruction?									
3. Do the assessments identify students who are at risk or already experiencing difficulty learning to read?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1
TOTAL								4	

PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT (PD)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments <i>(e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Is adequate time offered for teachers to learn new concepts and practice what they have learned?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Initial unit presents a familiar theme enabling the teacher to focus upon instructional procedures and become familiar with routines.
2. Is there a plan for coaches, mentors, peers, or outside experts to provide feedback to teachers and follow-up assistance as they put new concepts into practice?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
3. Are teachers taught how to administer and interpret assessments that accompany the program?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
4. Is program PD customized to meet participants' varying needs (e.g., first-year teachers, high ability, English learners, special education, coaches, and principals)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
5. Does the PD provide support (e.g., principal checklists, follow-up, in-class modeling, and a CD for viewing model lessons) to facilitate application of content?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
TOTAL								5	

