

# GUIDELINES FOR REVIEWING A CORE READING PROGRAM RUBRIC

Literacy By Design 2013 Houghton Mifflin Harcourt  
Grade 5

## Final Review

*Directions for use:*

- Thoroughly review the core reading program using the corresponding rubric.
- Only evaluate the individual components that correlate with the grade level to review. (*Note the placement of the "x" within the grade level columns.*)
- Each indicator must receive a score using the following criteria:
  - 2 – Exceeds expectations
  - 1 – Meets expectations
  - 0 – Does not meet expectations(*For any indicator receiving a 0, comments must be provided justifying the score.*)
- Record the total score for each area in the final row for the section.



The Reviewing a Reading Program Professional Development Participant's Guide publication was created for the Center on Instruction by the Florida Center for Reading Research at Florida State University. The Center on Instruction is operated by RMC Research Corporation in partnership with the Florida Center for Reading Research at Florida State University; Instructional Research Group; Lawrence Hall of Science at the University of California – Berkeley; Texas Institute for Measurement, Evaluation, and Statistics at the University of Houston; and The Meadows Center for Preventing Educational Risk at the University of Texas at Austin.

Guideline forms excerpted from *Reviewing a Reading Program Professional Development Module, Participant's Guide*, 2008, Center on Instruction.

The contents of the module and this document were developed under cooperative agreement S283B050034 with the U.S. Department of Education. However, these contents do not necessarily represent the policy of the Department of Education, and you should not assume endorsement by the Federal Government.



INSTRUCTIONAL DESIGN (ID)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments <i>(e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Is there empirical research on this program's efficacy?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	It is very thorough with many cited expert links.
2. Are resources available to help the teacher understand the rationale for the instructional approach and program strategies (e.g., articles, explanations in the teacher manuals, references, and reliable websites)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Explicitly instructed resources are available online at Think Central.
3. Does the comprehensive program address the five components of reading (phonological/phonemic awareness, phonics, fluency, vocabulary and comprehension)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
4. In addition to the five components of reading, are other dimensions of reading such as spelling, writing, oral language, and listening comprehension addressed?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	All components are integrated regularly.
5. Is there a scope and sequence?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
6. Are goals and objectives clearly stated?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
7. Are student materials aligned with instructional objective of the lesson?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
8. Do instructional materials increase in difficulty as students' skills strengthen?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
9. Are all lessons and activities (e.g., whole group, small group, and centers) reading-related?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Real differentiation is built-in with a mixture of whole, small, and flexible grouping
10. Is there a clear and logical organization to the lessons in:									
the order and procedures of each day's lesson?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	The order was very easy to follow without being overdone.
the inclusion of all necessary materials?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Think Central contains a wealth of online resources as well as those in print.
the consistency of each day's lesson format?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
addressing the components of reading every day?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
11. Is instruction consistently explicit? Is it concise, specific, and related to the objective?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
12. Are teacher directives highly details to ensure accurate implementation?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	



13. Does the lesson format facilitate frequent interactions between teacher and students?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	This is well developed with a gradual release of responsibility.
14. Is instruction consistently systematic? Is there a prescribed order for introducing specific skills within each component of reading?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
15. Are there coordinated instructional sequences and instructional routines which include:									
Modeling?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Think Alouds help provide examples.
Guided practice with feedback?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
Student practice and application?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	There are many opportunities for student to practice new skills independently.
Cumulative review?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
16. Are there many guided practice opportunities for explicit teaching and teacher-directed feedback (for typically progressing readers and more for struggling readers)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
17. Does the program provide clear guidance for the teacher to document student progress and inform instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	A variety of ways to document progress, from formal to informal, are present. There are also multiple online assessments with progress monitoring at Think Central.
18. Does instruction make a clear connection <i>among</i> all five components?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
19. Is scaffolding a prominent part of the lessons?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
20. Are instructions for scaffolding specific within each lesson?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
21. Are teachers encouraged to give immediate, specific feedback (corrective or positive)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
22. Is differentiated instruction prominent?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Differentiated instruction is inherent. There is more for below and on level than enrichment.
23. Is instruction differentiated based on assessment?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
24. Are directions for differentiating instruction specific?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
25. Is small-group instruction (small teacher-pupil ratio) part of daily instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
26. Are there guidelines for forming flexible groups based on student progress?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
27. Are enrichment activities included for advanced students?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	



28. Does the program provide instruction for English Learners?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
29. Does the program specify for whom it is appropriate (e.g., students on or above grade level, students slightly behind their peers, students more than one grade level behind their peers)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Leveled readers are incorporated.
<b>TOTAL</b>								<b>61</b>	

<b>PHONICS (P)</b>	<b>K</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Comments</b> <i>(e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Is phonics instruction <b>explicit</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
2. Is phonics instruction <b>systematic</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
3. Does phonics instruction include <b>coordinated instructional sequences and routines</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
4. Is phonics instruction <b>scaffolded</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	5th grade level phonics is focused on word study and morphological elements.
5. Does phonics instruction include <b>cumulative review</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Think Central provides weekly assessments of phonetic skills taught or reviewed that week.
6. Are assessments included to measure and monitor progress in <b>phonics</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	There are weekly online assessments at Think Central.
7. Are symbol to sound (decoding) and sound to symbol (spelling) taught explicitly?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	It assumes mastery of decoding skills at this level, but offers a developmental phonics CD for students who may be below mastery (unable to observe skills addressed on CD)
8. Is spelling taught during word learning so students can understand how sounds map onto print?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
9. Does instruction progress from simple to more complex concepts (e.g., CVC words before CCCVCC words and single syllable words before multisyllabic words)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
10. Are reviews of previously taught concepts and words frequent and cumulative?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
11. Is emphasis placed on fluency practice for each phonics component (e.g., sound identification, CVC blending, word recognition, multisyllabic words, and text reading)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
12. Are students taught the strategy of		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	



chunking when trying to decode multisyllabic words?									
13. Does the program provide teacher modeling of a think-aloud strategy to aid in multisyllabic word analysis?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
14. Are students taught strategies to read multisyllabic words by using prefixes, suffixes, and known word parts?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
15. Is instruction explicit in the use of syllable types (e.g., open, closed, vowel-consonant-e, vowel combinations, r-controlled, and consonant-le)?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
16. Is a section of the program devoted to advances phonics (structural analysis) skills?			X	X	X	X	X	2	
17. Are advanced phonics skills taught explicitly, first in isolation and then in words and connected texts?			X	X	X	X	X	2	
18. Does the program include spelling strategies (e.g., word sorts, categorization activities, word-building activities, and word analogies)?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
19. Is instruction in the meaning of roots and affixes explicit and do students analyze the relationship of spelling to meaning of complex words?				X	X	X	X	2	
20. Are word parts that occur with high frequency (e.g., un-, re-, in-, and -ful) taught rather than those that occur only in a few words?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
21. Are there activities for distinguishing and interpreting words with multiple meanings?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Supplemental materials will be required.
22. Once advanced phonics strategies have been mastered, are they immediately applied to reading and interpreting familiar and unfamiliar connected texts?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
23. Are words used in advanced phonics activities also found in student texts?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
<b>TOTAL</b>								<b>39</b>	

<b>FLUENCY (F)</b>	<b>K</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Comments</b> <i>(e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Is fluency instruction explicit?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	



2. Is fluency instruction <b>systematic</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Fluency instruction is always present.
3. Does fluency instruction include <b>coordinated instructional sequences and routines</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
4. Is fluency instruction <b>scaffolded</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Yes, it requires teacher progress monitoring.
5. Does fluency instruction include <b>cumulative review</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
6. Are assessments included to measure and monitor progress in <b>fluency</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	There are clear directions for teachers unfamiliar with coding text. There is a rubric for informal assessment as well as benchmarks and other more formal assessments.
7. Does the program address all dimensions of fluency (speed, accuracy, and prosody)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
8. Does the program encourage the teacher to model speed, accuracy, and prosody?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
9. Does fluency practice during letter-sound study and text reading involve the teacher's providing feedback to students?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
10. Is fluency instruction integrated into each day's lesson?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
11. Is the decoding strategy taught so that it becomes automatic?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
12. Are irregular words taught to be recognized automatically?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
13. Is there an emphasis on reading multisyllabic words fluently?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
14. Are research-based fluency strategies (e.g., timed readings, peer reading, and repeated readings) included?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
15. Is fluency practice introduced after students are proficient at reading words accurately (e.g., in lists, sentences, and passages)?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
16. Does fluency practice involve decodable texts (texts that include phonic elements and word types students have previously been taught)?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
17. Are both narrative and expository texts provided for students to read aloud?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	It is in-line with common core expectations of more informational text with a good balance for this age.
18. Are teacher prompts included to encourage students to read aloud in order to determine skills application and		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	This is routine during group time. Teacher directs students to select a couple of paragraphs to practice and read for fluency



accuracy?									
19. Are students given ample practice opportunities to use text at their independent or instructional level to help build fluency?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Many materials are available with a variety of options.
20. Is the number of texts at each level sufficient to provide adequate practice opportunities?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
21. Does the program clearly show the teacher how to determine independent, instructional, and frustrational reading levels for individual students?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Ample assessments are available to determine student reading level.
22. Is there a guide to help teachers calculate fluency rate?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
23. Do students have opportunities to time themselves and graph results after rereading the same text?			X	X	X	X	X	0	No evidence was found.  <u>Publisher Comment:</u> The Small Group Reading Appendix includes instructions for fluency routines including how to set up repeated readings for students to time themselves before and after rereading the same text.
24. Are there directions for how to pair students for partner reading?		X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No evidence was found.  <u>Publisher Comment:</u> Explicit directions on how to pair students for partner reading are provided in the Comprehensive Teacher's Guide Professional Development Handbook. Suggestions for fluency routines including partner reading are included in the Small Group Reading Teacher's Guide Appendix.
25. Are students taught a specific error correction to use when reading with a partner?		X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No evidence was found.  <u>Publisher Comment:</u> Literacy by Design includes daily partner work and teaches several error correction techniques.
26. Is there continuous progress monitoring of oral reading fluency?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
27. Is an end-of-the-year fluency goal of correct words per minute given for each grade?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	A small chart is available depicting grade levels.
<b>TOTAL</b>								<b>42</b>	

<b>VOCABULARY (V)</b>	<b>K</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Comments</b> <i>(e.g., examples, strengths, concerns,</i>
-----------------------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------	--------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------



										<i>questions)</i>
1. Is vocabulary instruction <b>explicit</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Marzano offers rich and intentional variety.
2. Is vocabulary instruction <b>systematic</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
3. Does vocabulary instruction include <b>coordinated instructional sequences and routines</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
4. Is vocabulary instruction <b>scaffolded</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
5. Does vocabulary instruction include <b>cumulative review</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
6. Are assessments included to measure and monitor progress in <b>vocabulary</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
7. Is emphasis placed on listening and speaking vocabulary?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	There is a great emphasis on listening.
8. Is there emphasis on reading and writing vocabulary?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
9. Are students exposed to diverse vocabulary through listening to or reading narrative and expository texts?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
10. Does the program include frequent use of teacher read-alouds using higher level books with explanation and instruction of key vocabulary?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	This is a central component.
11. Does the program include a variety of texts that allow students ample opportunities to engage in wide reading at their independent levels?		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	There is a very nice variety.
12. Does vocabulary instruction occur before, during, and after reading?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	It is present in all areas.
13. Are a limited number of words selected for robust, explicit vocabulary instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	It is precise; not overwhelming.
14. Are important, useful, and difficult words taught?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
15. Does the instructional routine for vocabulary include:										
Introducing the word?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
Presenting a student-friendly explanation?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
Clarifying the word with examples?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
Checking students' understanding?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Students' work in journals depicts ownership of the word.



16. Are ample opportunities provided to engage in oral vocabulary activities that:									
Repeat exposure to words in rich and multiple contexts?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
Use everyday language to explain word meanings?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
Connect word meanings to prior knowledge?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
17. Are students given multiple opportunities to use new words in reading sentences, paragraphs, or longer texts?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
18. Is extended instruction provided in multiple contexts to promote word awareness using word banks, vocabulary logs, writing, semantic maps, concept definition mapping, and word classification?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
19. Are strategies taught over time to ensure understanding and correct application?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
20. Are meanings of prefixes, roots, and suffixes taught before connecting them to words?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
21. Is a strategy to determine word meanings based on meanings of prefixes, roots, and suffixes taught?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
22. Are various aspects of word study included (either under vocabulary or word recognition) such as:									
Concepts of word meaning?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
Multiple meanings?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
Synonyms?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	While LBD vocabulary word work supports, synonyms, antonyms, multiple meanings, and homonyms, students may need more support than included with program.
Antonyms?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
Homonyms?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
Figurative meanings?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
Morphemic analysis?			X	X	X	X	X	1	
Etymologies?				X	X	X	X	1	
23. Is dictionary use explicitly taught using		X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No evidence found.





and to solve problems)?										
12. Does instruction support the use of multiple, coordinated comprehension strategies?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Reviews of comprehension skills are included.
13. Are guided and supported cooperative learning groups suggested as an instructional technique?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Many options are suggested such as group share, turn and talk, as well as the interactive reading procedures.
14. Does instruction begin with the use of short passages?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
15. Does instruction emphasize that students have a conceptual understanding of beginning, middle, and end?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
16. Does the program provide prompts for the teacher to guide the students through texts using think-alouds?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
17. Are models of effective questioning techniques (e.g., Bloom's taxonomy) provided to guide and monitor students' comprehension?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
18. Are there ample opportunities for students to listen to narrative and expository text?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
19. Is instruction in narrative and expository text structures explicit?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
20. Are there ample opportunities for students to read narrative and expository texts at independent and instructional levels?		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
21. Is there a variety of narrative and expository books at the appropriate readability level for student practice?		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	There are ample reading resources available for all readers.
22. Do texts contain useful and familiar concepts and vocabulary?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
23. Are there instructional routines for comprehension strategies for use before, during, and after reading (e.g., prediction, story grammar, summarization, graphic organizers)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
24. Is the "main idea" strategy taught systematically (e.g., using pictures, then individual sentences, then paragraphs, etc.)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
25. Once students have grasped the concept of "main idea," are more complex texts used in which the main idea is not explicit?		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	



26. Are elements of story grammar (e.g., setting, characters, important events, etc.) taught and used for retelling a story?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1		
27. Does instruction focus on discussion story grammar and comparing stories?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1		
28. Is story grammar introduced systematically, beginning with simple text that gradually becomes more complex?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1		
29. Are students taught to use graphic organizers to illustrate relationships among concepts in text (e.g., story maps, Venn diagrams, and semantic maps)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2		
30. Are conventions of expository text (e.g., chapter headings, charts, and graphs) taught?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2		
31. Are explicit strategies for interpreting information from charts, graphs, tables, and diagrams taught?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2		
32. After instruction, is there systematic review of:										
Literal comprehension?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1		
Retelling?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2		
Main idea?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1		
Summarization?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2		
33. Does the program provide instruction for students to become self-directed in using comprehension strategies (e.g., rereading, paraphrasing, making explicit connections from text to prior knowledge, underlining and note-taking, and visualizing relationships and events in the text)?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	There are many opportunities available.	
<b>TOTAL</b>									<b>65</b>	

<b>STANDARDS ALIGNMENT</b>	<b>K</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Comments</b> <i>(e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Is clear alignment provided to the Common Core State Standards?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	



2. Are instructional strategies using the Common Core State Standards embedded within and apparent throughout the program?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
3. Is clear alignment provided to the Indiana Academic Standards?			X	X	X	X	X	2	
<b>TOTAL</b>								<b>6</b>	

<b>MOTIVATION AND ENGAGEMENT (M&amp;E)</b>	<b>K</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Comments</b> <i>(e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
Does the program direct the teacher in ways to increase student motivation such as:									
1. Making reading relevant to students' lives?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
2. Providing meaningful goals for learning from texts?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
3. Making available a variety of choices (e.g., texts and assignments) that align with instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
4. Providing opportunities for students to work collaboratively?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	There are engaging opportunities for collaboration.
<b>TOTAL</b>								<b>8</b>	

<b>ASSESSMENT (A)</b>	<b>K</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Comments</b> <i>(e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Are assessments included that teachers can use to guide student movement through the program (e.g., screening, progress monitoring, diagnostic, and outcome measures)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
2. Does the program provide teacher guidance in using assessment results to differentiate instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
3. Do the assessments identify students who are at risk or already experiencing difficulty learning to read?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Assessments provide good resource for data-driven instruction.
<b>TOTAL</b>								<b>6</b>	



<b>PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT (PD)</b>	<b>K</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Comments</b> <i>(e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Is adequate time offered for teachers to learn new concepts and practice what they have learned?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	PD is available with online resources for teacher review.
2. Is there a plan for coaches, mentors, peers, or outside experts to provide feedback to teachers and follow-up assistance as they put new concepts into practice?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	PD is available for coaches, teachers and administrators.
3. Are teachers taught how to administer and interpret assessments that accompany the program?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
4. Is program PD customized to meet participants' varying needs (e.g., first-year teachers, high ability, English learners, special education, coaches, and principals)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
5. Does the PD provide support (e.g., principal checklists, follow-up, in-class modeling, and a CD for viewing model lessons) to facilitate application of content?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
<b>TOTAL</b>								<b>10</b>	

